

# COUNCIL

THURSDAY, 23 MAY 2024

Present: Councillor S Paterson, Mayor

Councillors: D Bagshaw  
P J Bales  
L A Ball BEM  
R E Bofinger  
M Brown  
R Bullock  
G Bunn  
B C Carr  
C Carr  
S J Carr  
A Cooper  
T A Cullen  
S Dannheimer  
H J Faccio  
K Harlow  
G S Hills  
S P Jeremiah  
S Kerry  
A Kingdon  
H Land  
D L MacRae  
R D MacRae  
T J Marsh  
G Marshall  
J W McGrath  
W Mee  
J M Owen  
P J Owen  
D D Pringle  
M Radulovic MBE  
H E Skinner  
P A Smith  
V C Smith  
C M Tideswell  
D K Watts  
S Webb  
E Williamson  
E Winfield  
K Woodhead

15 APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors S A Bagshaw, H Crosby, H G Khaled MBE and A G W A Stockwell.

16 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Councillor E Winfield declared an other-registerable interest in item 4.1 as she is the Chair of Broxtowe Community Partnership, minute number 20 refers.

Councillors D Bagshaw, M Radulovic MBE, E Williamson and K Woodhead declared other registerable interests in item 7.1 due to their Town Council memberships, minute number 21.1 refers.

Councillors P Bales, R Bullock, M Brown, G S Hills, J M Owen, P J Owen stated that they had received a dispensation prior to the meeting item 7.1, minute number 21.1 refers.

17 NOTICE OF MOTIONS

17.1 THE FOLLOWING MOTION WAS RECEIVED FROM COUNCILLORS D K WATTS, H LAND, A KINGDON, S J CARR AND D L MACRAE

The motion was proposed by Councillor D K Watts and seconded by Councillor H Land.

“The Council notes that the owner of Beeston Farmers Market has not had the lease renewed by the Council and further notes that the Council have now said that they intend to run a farmer’s market themselves.”

This Council believes that it is not at all clear why such a decision was made or how Beeston and the Borough of Broxtowe will benefit from such a move. This Council further believes that the communications around this decision have been nothing short of disastrous and reflect very badly on the Council.

This Council therefore resolves to instruct the Chief Executive to arrange for an independent investigation to be held into all aspects of how and why this decision was taken and further how it was communicated, and for the result of that investigation to be communicated to a future meeting of the Borough Council not more than six months from today.”

At the conclusion of the debate a recorded vote was called for. The voting was as follows:

<u>For</u>	<u>Against</u>	<u>Abstention</u>
B C Carr	D Bagshaw	L A Ball BEM
S J Carr	P Bales	M Brown
A Kingdon	R E Bofinger	G S Hills
H Land	R Bullock	S Kerry
D L MacRae	G Bunn	J M Owen
R D MacRae	C Carr	P J Owen

D K Watts  
E Williamson

A Cooper  
T A Cullen  
S Dannheimer  
H J Faccio  
K A Harlow  
S P Jeremiah  
T J Marsh  
G Marshall  
J W McGrath  
W Mee  
S Paterson  
M Radulovic MBE  
H E Skinner  
P A Smith  
V C Smith  
C M Tideswell  
S Webb  
E Winfield  
K Woodhead

D D Pringle

On being put to the meeting, the motion was lost.

#### 18 PRESENTATION OF PETITIONS RELATING TO MOTION 4.1

The Mayor stated that the items relating to the petitions and public questions would be moved forward in the agenda to allow for the public participation in the meeting to be fully considered prior to the vote contained within the motion on Car Parking Charges.

Councillor W Mee presented a petition of under 1,000 signatories from residents calling for the Council to abolish the new evening car park charges at Victoria Street Kimberley.

Councillor E Williamson presented a petition of under 1,000 signatories from residents calling for the Council to review the off-street car charges across the Borough.

Philippa Dytham-Double presented a petition of over 1,000 signatories. In presenting the petition Ms Dytham-Double stated that "On 1 January the parking charges changed in the two Council car parks on Chilwell Road. Many businesses are already seeing a drop in business and have serious concerns about the long-term effect of this on their livelihoods.

When the tram was installed on Chilwell Road, the free on-street parking was removed and replaced by the two car parks and one-hour free parking was in place to provide short stay parking instead.

We are asking Broxtowe Borough Council to reverse the change to parking charges for both car parks on Chilwell Road and reinstate the free hour and free evening parking."

It was stated that the subject of the petition would be debated during consideration of the motion on this subject, and Ms Dytham-Double would receive a decision on how

the Council would proceed with the petition on the conclusion of consideration of the motion.

19 PUBLIC QUESTIONS RELATING TO MOTION 4.1

19.1 THE FOLLOWING QUESTIONS HAD BEEN SUBMITTED BY MR HASITHA DE SILVA, A BUSINESS OWNER IN BEESTON, AND MR KANE OLIVER, A BUSINESS OWNER FROM EASTWOOD, FOR THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL AND PORTFOLIO HOLDER FOR ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND ASSET MANAGEMENT

The first question was asked by Mr Hasitha De Silva, a business owner from Beeston as follows:

“One of Broxtowe Borough Councils stated aims is to: ‘Support and develop activity that promotes regeneration and the vitality of the Borough’s Town Centres.’

Would the Leader of the Council therefore agree with me that the removal of free for an hour parking alongside the introduction of evening charges has been a disaster for Town Centres in the Borough? Furthermore, the reduction in town centre footfall numbers, due to the reduction in people paying to park in the town centres and, without the benefit of commensurate improvements in public transport links, has directed contributed to many small independent businesses now being in a precarious financial position? Will he agree to a full consultation on these changes and an urgent review?”

A further question was asked by Mr Kane Oliver, a business owner from Eastwood, as follows:

“Eastwood’s Levelling up bid failed and now this Council’s decision to introduce additional parking charges in the Town Centres has delivered another blow to businesses and residents in Eastwood. One of the stated aims of this Council is to work with key stakeholders in Eastwood to produce regeneration plans.

Would the Leader agree with me that by removing the free for one-hour parking and introducing evening parking charges without consultation, the centre of Eastwood is at a disadvantage when consumers make decisions about where to shop? The adjacent authority Ashfield still retains free parking for two hours.”

In response, the Leader stated that it was not true that free parking had been removed, as there was free parking at weekends and three of the four car parks in Kimberley were free. With reference to Beeston, it was stated that all car parks were free on no Sunday and other authorities charged for parking.

It was necessary for the Authority to make up for a lack of financing to regenerate the Borough’s Town Centres. The statement that the Council had not invested in small business was wrong. Town Centres had been affected by the withdrawal of branches of major banks.

19.2 THE FOLLOWING QUESTION HAD BEEN SUBMITTED BY MS PHILIPA DYTHAN-DOUBLE, A BUSINESS OWNER IN BEESTON, PORTFOLIO HOLDER FOR RESOURCES AND PERSONNEL POLICY.

“Businesses on Chilwell Road suffered years of disruption due to the Tram Works. Many customers left for good and no longer shop in this area although many have also returned. At the time we lost all on-street parking due to the tram build. The two car parks on Chilwell Road were installed to replace the removed on-street parking.

Would the Portfolio Holder agree that, along with other parts of the Borough, businesses in Beeston, are struggling as a result of the changes brought in on 1 Jan 2024 to the parking charges? Will he re-affirm Broxtowe Council’s commitment to vibrant town centres by re-instating the free for one-hour parking and review evening parking arrangements?”

In response, the Portfolio Holder stated that there were never large numbers of free parking spaces prior to the introduction of the tram. The tram was important for investment in the area. The Council has subsidised parking although the compensation for the tram had not been fully received.

All policies are regularly reviewed and parking would not be different. There will be continued engagement with small business owners on the impact of trams. There was further commitment to a working group which would include small businesses.

20 THE FOLLOWING MOTION WAS RECEIVED FROM COUNCILLORS: R D MACRAE, D L MACRAE, S J CARR, B C CARR, E WILIAMSON

The motion was proposed by Councillor S J Carr and seconded by Councillor B C Carr as follows:

“All Members of the Broxtowe Independent Group have been approached by a number of independent small shop owners in Beeston, Eastwood and Stapleford.

This Council notes:

1. The significant downturn in business turnover since the removal of free parking in several car parks across the town centres.
2. Customers of many independent businesses have told owners that they will not pay for parking and will instead go where they can park for free.
3. No consultation took place with residents or businesses prior to the changes.
4. The increase in charges was not in the ruling party’s manifesto in the election just 6 months prior to this decision being implemented.

This Council calls for an immediate and urgent review of parking charges and requests that an inquiry, conducted in public is set up into the adverse impact of the new charges on all Town Centres’ independent businesses.”

During the debate an amendment was proposed by Councillor P J Owen and seconded by Councillor D D Pringle to replace the final paragraph of the original amendment as follows:

“This Council calls for an immediate and urgent review of parking charges by Cabinet, conducted in public, to investigate how these new charges can be reversed to remove the adverse impact of the new charges on all Town Centres’ independent businesses.”

On being put to Councillors S J Carr and B C Carr, the amendment was accepted and added to the original motion.

At the conclusion of the debate a recorded vote was called for. The voting was as follows:

<u>For</u>	<u>Against</u>	<u>Abstention</u>
L A Ball BEM	D Bagshaw	
M Brown	P Bales	
B C Carr	R E Bofinger	
S J Carr	R Bullock	
G S Hills	G Bunn	
S Kerry	C Carr	
A Kingdon	A Cooper	
H Land	T A Cullen	
D L MacRae	S Dannheimer	
R D MacRae	H J Faccio	
J M Owen	K A Harlow	
P J Owen	S P Jeremiah	
D D Pringle	T J Marsh	
D K Watts	G Marshall	
E Williamson	J W McGrath	
	W Mee	
	S Paterson	
	M Radulovic MBE	
	H E Skinner	
	P A Smith	
	V C Smith	
	C M Tideswell	
	S Webb	
	E Winfield	
	K Woodhead	

On being put to the meeting, the motion was lost.

In relation to the petition relating to item 4.1 which was submitted earlier in the meeting, the Leader stated that he would hold a group of meetings to discuss comprehensive proposals with the newly installed Mayor for the East Midlands Combined Authority in order to attract Government funding.

## 21 REFERENCE FROM COMMITTEES

### 21.1 GOVERNANCE, AUDIT AND STANDARDS COMMITTEE 20 MAY 2024

#### Community Governance Review – Consideration of Final Recommendation

Council considered the draft recommendations put forward for consultation by the Governance, Audit & Standards Committee and its associated Working Group. The

report considered by the Committee has been distributed with the agenda and the resolution agreed at the meeting was as follows:

RECOMMENDED to Council that numbers 1-5 as forwarded by the Governance, Audit & Standards Committee and its associated Task & Finish Group and detailed in the report, be approved for the consultation process.

It had been agreed that the following be submitted to the Governance, Audit and Standards Committee to be approved as the draft recommendation:

That:

1. In line with consultation option 1 and subject to the amendment to the proposal in respect of Brinsley as set out in (iii) below, Greasley Parish Council be dissolved and the Greasley Parish area be dealt with as follows:

- (i). the creation of a new parish comprising of all of the current Eastwood Parish area, Giltbrook, Newthorpe, Moorgreen and the outlying properties in Greasley Parish, comprising the 5 Parish Wards of:

<b>Parish Ward</b>	<b>No of Councillors</b>
Eastwood Hall	2
Eastwood Hilltop	5
Eastwood St Mary's	5
Greasley Castle	3
Smithurst	4

- (ii). the new Parish Council in (i) above be named Eastwood and Greasley Town Council;
- (iii). the inclusion in Brinsley Parish of Saint's Coppice Farm, Cordy Lane, Felley Mill Farm and Old Hags Farmhouse, Mill Lane and 2 properties on Mansfield Road from – Map 2;
- (iv). the inclusion in Nuthall Parish of the 555 properties on the Larkfields estate currently in Greasley Parish and 3 properties on Woodside Avenue currently in Kimberley Parish – Map 3;
- (v). the inclusion in Kimberley Parish of – Map 4:
- (a) 879 properties currently in the Watnall Ward of Greasley Parish, 2 properties on Nottingham Road Giltbrook, and 11 on Gilt Hill from Greasley Parish
- (b) 3 properties on Nottingham Road Kimberley, 2 on Knowle Hill currently in Nuthall Parish
- (c) 4 properties addressed to Swingate currently in Strelley Parish to create a new Kimberley and Watnall Town Council;

2. No changes be made in respect of the NES3 polling district so that Strelley remains a parish with a Parish Meeting.

3. The boundary of Strelley Parish be amended to include Oldmoor Farm and Turkey Fields Farm – Map 5.

4. It is noted that the area of land east of Coventry Lane which Council agreed should be transferred to the unparished area from Trowell on 11 May 2022 was omitted in error from the Broxtowe (Re-organisation of Community Governance) Order 2022 and will be included in the Order made to bring the changes approved through this review into effect.

5. The Local Government Boundary Commission for England be asked to make the following related alterations to align the new Parish and borough ward boundaries:
- Brinsley
  - Kimberley
  - Nuthall East and Strelley
  - Watnall and Nuthall West

A recorded vote was called for and the voting was as follows:

<u>For</u>	<u>Against</u>	<u>Abstention</u>
P Bales	L A Ball BEM	D K Watts
R E Bofinger	M Brown	
R Bullock	G S Hills	
G Bunn	S Kerry	
C Carr	D L MacRae	
B C Carr	R D MacRae	
S J Carr	J M Owen	
A Cooper	P J Owen	
T A Cullen	D D Pringle	
S Dannheimer		
H J Faccio		
K A Harlow		
S P Jeremiah		
A Kingdon		
H Land		
T J Marsh		
G Marshall		
J W McGrath		
W Mee		
S Paterson		
H E Skinner		
P A Smith		
V C Smith		
C M Tideswell		
S Webb		
E Winfield		

**RESOLVED that numbers 1-5 as forwarded by the Governance, Audit & Standards Committee and its associated Task & Finish Group and detailed above, be approved for the consultation process.**

(Having declared other registerable interests Councillors D Bagshaw, M Radulovic MBE, E Williamson and K Woodhead left the meeting before discussion or voting thereon.)

(Councillors P Bales, R Bullock, M Brown, G S Hills, J M Owen, P J Owen stated that they had received a dispensation prior to the meeting for the item.)